

Arlington Historic District Commissions

August 23, 2018
Whittemore Robbins House

Final & Approved Minutes

**Commissioners
Present:**

N. Aikenhead, M. Audin, C. Barry, M. Bush, C. Hamilton,
S. Makowka, C. Tee, J. Worden

**Commissioners
Not Present:**

D. Baldwin, B. Cohen, S. Lipp

Guests:

P. Guthrie, M. Silverman, J. Gillis, S. Snow, Z. Dutton, D. Dutton
K. Miller

1. AHDC Meeting Opens 8:00pm
2. Appointment of alternate Commissioners: Mt Gilboa – C. Barry, C. Hamilton; Pleasant -- C. Barry, C. Hamilton, M Bush
3. Approval of draft minutes from July 26, 2018. Motion to approve by C. Barry, seconded M. Audin, unanimous approval
4. Communications
 - a. Email from M. Audin updating Project List
 - b. Application from J. Nicoloro (24 Maple St.) for fiberglass gutters – modified to be all wood and CONA to be issued
 - c. Application for 6 Central St (Piechota) for roof replacement CONA
 - d. Email from J. Nicoloro (24 Maple St.) advising original application for fiberglass gutters no longer required – will be using all wood gutters so a CONA can be issued
 - e. Call from neighbor at 18 Russell Terrace requesting info on CONA issued for air condenser. See attached email from S. Makowka also.
 - f. Call re: 251 Pleasant Street (Irving) regarding various projects and CONA and COA application processes
 - g. Email for info on 12 Elder Terrace (Silverman) garage application from 2010. New owner is interested in old history of ideas on garage renovations.
 - h. Call from neighbor with questions on work at 79 Crescent Hill Ave. on rear staircase (now deck and staircase)
 - i. Application for 79 Crescent Hill Ave. (Snow) for gutter replacement
 - j. Application for 79 Crescent Hill Ave. (Snow) for staircase replacement
 - k. Emails and application and documentation for 105 Crescent Hill
 - l. Emails with info for 72 Westminster Ave. Formal Hearing on 8/23
 - m. Application for Solar Panels at 235 Pleasant Street
 - n. CONA Application for 170 Pleasant Street (Gillis) for gutter replacement and repair
 - o. Email from 12 Russell Terrace (Caritas) for CONA request for stair repairs

- p. Email from 20 Russel St, Apt 2 (Martin) re: storm window replacement and subsequent response from S Makowka to resident
- q. Email from Melissa Tintocalis re: HDC guidelines
- r. J. Worden received ad from Pella windows to replace windows. He felt they need to advise people that they should get a certificate from the HDC. – C. Greeley to send out new letter to District property owners
- s. C. Barry brought up concern about Jason Street work done hard-topping the tree strip to the curb – discussed on the Arlington List
- t. M. Audin received emails from N. Bishir re: project work at 62 Westminster Ave.
- u. Town Day Application approved for 9-15-18 booth
- v. S. Makowka email with proposed Design Guideline changes to AHDC Commissioners

5. Other Business

- a. Central Street and Avon Place Historic District vacant commissioner seat
- b. Discussion on Guidelines -- deferred to next month
- c. Report from Streetscape sub-committee -- Update from sub-committee

6. New Business

- a. **Formal Hearing re: 72 Westminster Avenue for addition and roof changes.** K. Miller, from Miller Design gave presentation. Owners have lived at house since 2011. Previous owners had approval for porch renovation but never completed the project. Adjacent to porch, there is currently a small mud room that is not part of main house. That portion of the structure is not insulated and has no foundation. The additional front entrance on this façade is not really used so the owners wanted to reconstruct that area and make it part of main house to improve flow downstairs. This change also allows bathroom expansion. Plans make things more consistent with how the rest of the house looks. Realized probably need a 2nd bathroom upstairs and downstairs would allow some space to have a master bath so project expanded from just 1st floor to both floors. Makes sense to improve house as a whole all at the same time. There will be no net gain of square footage on 1st floor – just change in the layout where you will come in front door, have mudroom, closet and powder room.

Regarding siding, they want to match dimensions of existing aluminum clapboards on new siding using appropriate materials. That is, the house will be a combo of aluminum siding (existing) and wood siding (new construction). They are proposing to use K style aluminum gutters to match existing gutters. The project will add 64 SF on 2nd floor but new house proportions will match better with the original structure. J. Worden said he would prefer removal of artificial siding – applicant said they are limited with funds so not planning to do that at this time. Front part will be covered porch. C Barry said be careful that the porch posts are not too spindly. Posts are 5" turned – original thought was for a 4 x 4 PT posts that would be clad in wood. They looked around and Arl Coal and Lumber has the proposed profile available. M. Audin said even though you don't have financial resources at this time – everything about house is very straight forward but the posts not being straightforward will make them stand out. He would prefer square posts with some base molding and simplicity. Also, specified that we typically ask for 1 ½" x 1 ½ balusters set 4" on center. Discussion about the posts and balusters. Also, porch roof. M. Audin and C. Barry disagreed when M. Audin suggested flat roof like a Greek temple. K. Miller said they prefer what is proposed and not a flat roof. Main gables aren't hipped so this is why he didn't do it but did put gable over front door. S. Makowka said mixture of different types of

roofs seems very inconsistent. Will look at it as an asphalt roof with a 3-12 pitch. Concern about a leaky roof. K. Miller will explore redesigning the roof as a 3-12 pitch hip. Siding on new addition – suggestion by S. Makowka to match what's under rather than the aluminum siding which might be removed in the future. Matching the spacing of the tin might be artificial. The Commission suggested that the monitor can work with the applicant during the exploration part of the project to keep the project moving along during the discovery phases. The Hardee Plank material reduces having to paint as often, but the HDC does not allow.

C. Barry said that the plans show 4 over 1 the addition windows which does not match the rest of the house. – K. Miller said they can do 2 over 1. The new foundation is exposed concrete. C. Barry didn't like this finish. K. Miller said a good mason can get pretty close to matching the stone. S. Makowka said the big picture window isn't what would be original but it is existing. C. Barry said front stairs are part of the face of the building and they should be detailed. The tread and riser and side skirts – scotia mold with return is a nice detail. It's what you'll see every day and gives a sense of heft. S. Makowka had question about new gabled roof. The plan view makes it look big but he wonders if anyone has any reaction that this is out of proportion on this house. M. Bush said other houses in area are similar. New gable is drawn a touch higher than the existing one – K. Miller clarified that it's supposed to line up with the existing ridge. Discussion about height of railings as well by Commissioners. Windows proposed – Pella architectural windows – all wood, no clad. M. Bush said his one concern is the decision on the gutters. C. Barry said we have some precedent with a house on Pleasant Street by allowing the k-style gutters to match. Stone foundation rather than cement will cost a lot more than proposed. Proposed tight parge with stucco. S. Makowka suggested compromise of using K style upstairs on new addition where eaves meet existing gutters, but around front porch use either fiberglass gutters to match originals. K. Miller said his concern is that by time we beef up fascia boards, integrate fiberglass gutters, this piece of fascia is going to be so dramatically different from rest of house – this is going to be so different that it is over articulated and not matching the other things on the house. He is concerned.

M. Bush made a motion to approve the application as submitted with modifications to the gable of the porch (turn it into a hip), that the concrete be parched, windows be 2 over 1 to match condition, no Hardee Plank, railing details to be approved by the monitor along with the hip roof details, and k style gutters throughout. J. Worden seconded for discussion purposes. C. Barry said he feels the fiberglass gutters will add a lot to the house especially at porch level. The applicant clarified that the ceiling is a wood board material. Mahogany porch decking or alternate material to be approved by monitor prior to installation. Decking to run vertical to the house towards the street. M. Bush amended his motion to approve K-style up high with no approval of any porch gutters at the moment. J. Worden seconded updated motion. Motion approved by unanimous vote. The Commission clarified that the applicant will come back at a future hearing to discuss treatment of porch gutters. Monitor appointed: M. Audin.

- b. **Formal Hearing re: 79 Crescent Hill Ave. for the change of wood gutters to gutters** from the Fiberglass Gutter Company. S. Snow present. S. Makowka clarified that the Commission has issued a CONA for repair and replacement of existing wood porch and gutters. The applicant is now looking to replace the wood gutter on the left side with fiberglass gutters. S. Makowka suggested that any approval require that gutter would be installed so all the trim details come together and are finished on the end. S. Makowka moved approval for fiberglass gutters. Seconded by C. Barry. Motion approved by unanimous vote. The Commission clarified that it will formally notice changes to rear stairs for next month's meeting. Monitor appointed: C. Barry.

- c. **Informal Hearing re: 235 Pleasant Street for solar panel installation.** Will come in next month for a formal hearing and will send all documentation.
- d. **Informal Hearing re: 12 Elder Terrace re: garage changes – will come in next month**
- e. **Informal Hearing re: 170 Pleasant Street re: gutter changes.** Looking to make copper gutters throughout the house. Old aluminum broken gutters where copper ones don't exist. You won't see any seams. All new downspouts except for 1 roundish style in back will match existing ones. C. Barry moved that this change is so insignificant that it is appropriate for approval pending a 10-day notification period. Seconded by M. Audin. Unanimous approval. C. Barry moved that we accept proposal to replace aluminum gutters with copper and two roundish style in back replace to match existing. Seconded by M. Audin. Motion approved by unanimous vote. Monitor appointed: C. Hamilton.

7. OPEN FORUM

Ordinarily, any matter presented to the Commission under Open Forum will neither be acted upon nor a formal decision made, absent a previously noticed agenda item, but the Commission may make a decision if it deems it appropriate and necessary for the public good.

- a. P. Guthrie present to discuss Arlington Center for the Arts' new clayroom which include some kilns which need to be vented. Vent would be located under eave, round disk would be painted to match, located high off the ground. C. Barry said to center it on the space so it doesn't look random. Center on the joint or on the bead or something like that. The Commission noted that the proposed location is really high off the ground. M. Bush moved that the proposed vent is such an insubstantial change that it is appropriate for approval pending a 10-day notification period. Seconded by M. Audin. Motion approved by unanimous vote. J. Worden moved that if after the 10 day notification period has passed and there have been no objections from abutters, that the applicant be authorized to install vent in soffit in gable as shown in application. Seconded by C. Tee. Motion approved by unanimous vote. Monitor appointed: S. Makowka.
- b. N. Bishir re: 62 Westminster Ave. approved repairs and renovations including replacing windows with like or better. The 1880 mansard with bay windows has not been taken care of over time. The new roof is on and certificate said Pella 2 over 2 wood windows. The question is – both the Pella sales rep. needs to know that the bay windows are no longer all wood – now wood with aluminum clad exterior and walk out basement sliders. M. Audin said the sliders are not visible. Bay windows – 2 in front of house being replaced.
- c. J. Worden said we took a stand on the railroad tracks in front of the Jefferson Cutter House and he would like the HDC to take a stand on the Fusco and Collomb Buildings at Arlington High School. The Collomb building replicates the Bullfinch façade of the new State House and has a roof that replicates the peak of the old state house. There have been attempts to contact the AHC and Mass. State Historical Commission and not received any response. Is there any sentiment on the HDC to take a stand on the buildings? S. Makowka said the Fusco and the Collomb buildings are iconic for the town and maintaining the streetscape is important – once it's gone it's gone. M. Bush moved that the Chair submit a letter on behalf of the Commission. He asked that J. Worden prepare a draft. Motion approved by unanimous vote.

8. REVIEW OF PROJECTS – Monitor for September – N. Aikenhead

9. EXECUTIVE SESSION – To discuss ongoing litigation

10:50pm

S. Makowka moved that the HDC move into executive session to adjourn at the end of executive session for the night. Seconded by C. Barry.

Roll Call: N. Aikenhead, M. Audin, C. Barry, M. Bush, C. Hamilton, S. Makowka, C. Tee, J. Worden

EXECUTIVE SESSION (Refer to Separate Minutes)

.

10. MEETING ADJOURNED DIRECTLY FROM EXECUTIVE SESSION

11pm